

The Connotations and Political Dimensions in the Selection of the Head of State - The Pledge of Abu Bakr Al-Siddiq as a Model -

Dr. Ali Ghanem¹, Dr. Baya Benachour², Pr. Saliha Benachour³

¹ University of Batna 1, Department of Language and Islamic Civilization, College of Islamic Sciences.

² University of Batna 1, College of Law and Political Sciences.

³ University of Batna 1, College of Islamic Sciences.

The Author's Email: alitalib012@gmail.com¹, karim6643@hotmail.fr², saliha.benachour@univ-batna.dz³

Received: 07/2023

Published: 09/2023

Abstract:

This research falls within the realm of political jurisprudence, focusing on the significant connotations and political dimensions derived from the selection of Abu Bakr Al-Siddiq as a model for the first head of state after the passing of the Prophet Muhammad, peace be upon him. It also compares this with contemporary political thought in the field of establishing political legitimacy for rulers and their performance of authority acquired through free popular will.

Keywords: Political connotations, Political dimensions, Selection the head of state, Head of state, Political legitimacy.

Introduction:

The selection of a head of state is an equation whose two sides are the nation or its genuine representatives, and the most suitable candidate for the presidency of the state, chosen by the nation through its free will.

Research Problem:

The problem of this research revolves around the extent to which the political implications and dimensions manifest in the selection of Abu Bakr Al-Siddiq as well as the most significant criticisms of his selection and the responses to them. What are the political implications and dimensions that can be derived from this?

Importance of the Research and its Objectives:

1- The phenomenon of selecting Abu Bakr and the subsequent Rashidun Caliphs is noteworthy for study, as contemporary governance systems often involve coercion, tyranny, and the inheritance of power.

2- The symbolism of selecting the Rashidun Caliphs remains significant among generations of Muslims, as the aspiration to revive prevailing political values and principles persists in their hearts and minds.

3- The urgent need of the nation to seek guidance from this pioneering political experience that stands witness in our Islamic civilization.

4- Drawing lessons and insights from the initial experience of our civilization, adapting them to the conditions and circumstances of the nation in various times and places.

Research Methodology:

The predominant methodology employed in this research is the historical approach due to its methodical steps, such as defining the topic, formulating the research problem, and gathering information. Furthermore, it encompasses various techniques, including extrapolation and tracking, critique and examination, substantiation and documentation, analysis and justification. Additionally, the research incorporates comparative analysis within its framework.

Research Plan:

To comprehensively address the various aspects of the research and address its problem, we have formulated a plan consisting of two main axes, an introduction, and a conclusion. The introduction discussed the essential methodological elements. The first axis delved into the political implications of choosing a head of state, while the second axis explored the political dimensions of pledging allegiance to Abu Bakr. The conclusion summarized the key findings of the research.

Axis 1: Political Implications in Choosing a Head of State

Section 1: Conceptual Introduction

1. President: Linguistic and Terminological Aspects

A. President in Language and Terminology

***Linguistic Meaning of "President":**

Ibn Manzur stated: "And the head of everything is above it... The president: the leader of the people, and the plural is 'rulers' or 'chiefs'. It also refers to the head... The leader of the people becomes their president and leader, and it is said in a hadith: The leader of disbelief from the direction of the east¹".

The prominent linguistic meanings include sovereignty and high status.

¹ - Refer to: Ibn Manzur, Muhammad ibn Mukarram ibn Ali, Abu al-Fadl, Jamal al-Din Ibn Manzur al-Ansari al-Ruwayfi'i al-Afriqi. "Lisan al-Arab." Dar Sader, Beirut, 3rd edition, 1414 AH, Volume 6, pages 91-92, entry "Ra's" (Head).

****Terminological Meaning of "President":**

Based on the linguistic meanings, it is evident that the president is the master of the people and their highest leader, who manages their public affairs.

B. State: Linguistic and Terminological Aspects***Linguistic Meaning of "State":**

The term "state" in language is pronounced with a strong "d" sound, either with a vowel mark indicating "fathah" or "dammah". It refers to the outcomes in wealth and war. Some have said that with a "dammah" it refers to wealth, and with a "fathah" it refers to war. It has also been said that with a "dammah" it pertains to the Hereafter, and with a "fathah" it pertains to the worldly life. In its plural form, it can be pronounced as "duwal" with a "dammah" and "fathah", or "dawal" with a "kasrah" and "fathah". The term conveys the predominant notion of power and authority. It is said, "They have yielded to us (dawl) over our enemies", meaning our victory over them¹.

Thus, the term "state" is derived from the concept of dominance and the supremacy of its authority. Otherwise, it would not have been referred to as a "state" in the first place. Therefore, it is said that indeed, God will shake the ruler with what is not shaken by the Quran, as an indication of the deterrent power of the state, especially when the power of conscience and morality weakens.

****The State: Technical Definition**

The state is defined as a stable population within a specific territory, subject to a certain political authority. This definition is commonly agreed upon by most legal scholars due to its incorporation of the principal elements required for the establishment of any state. These elements include the population, territory, and authority. Despite variations in the formulation of the definition by each jurist based on their legal perspective of the concept of the state, these core elements remain consistent².

Therefore, the state, according to this modern concept, is somewhat analogous to collective ownership of its citizens, unlike what prevailed in the eras of empires where the boundaries of their territories extended to the farthest points reached by their armies.

¹ - Refer to: Ibn Manzur, same reference, Volume 11, page 252, entry "Dawla" (State).

² - Refer to: "The State: Its Definition, Its Pillars, Its Legal Foundations, and Guarantees for Its Achievement." Article published on Monday, December 12, 2011, on the website <http://nehroes.blogspot.com>. Date of access: 01/02/2022, Time: 14:44.

From the foregoing, it can be said that the head of state is a title for someone who holds the highest executive authority in leading and managing the state. They are a symbol of its sovereignty.

One of the justifications for adopting this definition is considering the state, from a geographical perspective, as public property with legal personality. In this sense, there must be an individual to lead and manage both aspects, thus ensuring sovereignty.

C. The Selection of the Head of State

Based on the previous linguistic and terminological definitions, and the consensus of contemporary political practices, the process of selecting the head of state can be formulated as follows: The selection of the head of state is the process of choosing and favoring the best candidate for the presidency of the state, seeking the welfare and satisfaction of the nation.

Some justifications for adopting this definition are as follows:

- The first part of the definition encompasses the necessary procedures for selection, such as nomination, selection, and preference. The phrase "best candidate for the presidency of the state" imposes a condition that indicates the effort in selecting the most suitable person for the position and prioritizing them over others.
- The second part of the definition includes the goal of the selection process, which is to serve the highest interests of the nation, represented by its stability and prosperity, provided that this is done with its satisfaction. The condition of satisfaction is also specified in the definition, indicating the presence of a free will of the nation in the selection process, without coercion or force.

Secondly: The Pledge of Allegiance

This section addresses the linguistic and terminological concept of the pledge of allegiance, as well as its contemporary political implications.

1- The Pledge of Allegiance in Language and Terminology

A- The Pledge of Allegiance in Language

Ibn Manzur stated: "Al-Bay'ah (the pledge of allegiance): It is a transaction based on agreeing to the sale, and on mutual commitment and obedience... They may have a mutual agreement on a matter, like saying 'I agree with him,' and 'I pledge allegiance to him' is a pledge and commitment. And 'I have pledged allegiance to him' is from the perspective of the sale... In a hadith, it is mentioned that he (Prophet Muhammad) said: 'Won't you pledge allegiance to me on Islam?' This is an expression of establishing a contract and covenant,

as if each of them has sold what he possesses to the other and given him his complete self, obedience, and submission to his authority¹".

Based on the foregoing, the term "pledge of allegiance" is applied to the contract of sale or transaction, as described by Ibn Manzur. It also refers to a commitment to obedience, obligating the parties involved to adhere to the agreed terms. Its prominent linguistic meanings include "contract" and "covenant".

B - Allegiance in Terminology

Definitions have varied in explaining the terminological meaning of "pledge of allegiance," including:

Al-Qalqashandi defined it as follows: "It is the gathering of those who are eligible for leadership, and they collectively agree to establish the leadership for the one who fulfills its conditions²".

Abu Zahra stated: "It is a binding contract made between the ruler and the ruled, and it is more stringent and secure for the ruler³".

Al-Khalladi defined it as: "The right of the nation to sign the contract of caliphate. It is also a covenant between the nation and the ruler regarding governance according to Sharia and their obedience to him⁴".

And Al-Sanhoury regarded it as "election," considering the two terms to have the same meaning when discussing the nature of election⁵. Al-Sanhoury's statement suggests that this understanding is attributed to the political aspect of allegiance (bay'ah), while in other cases, this aspect is not required. This is because allegiance does not necessarily involve choice or selection; rather, it entails a moral commitment only.

Based on the aforementioned, it is evident that the reason for the variation in definitions is attributed to the perspective from which they originate. Is it the specific allegiance issued by those authorized to make decisions, considering

¹- Refer to: Ibn Manzur, previous reference, Volume 8, page 26.

²- See: Al-Qalqashandi, Ahmad ibn Ali ibn Ahmad al-Fazari al-Qalqashandi, then al-Qahiri (d. 821 AH), "The Monuments of Elegance in the Landmarks of the Caliphate." Edited by Abd al-Sattar Ahmad Faraj, Kuwait Government Press, Kuwait, 2nd edition, 1985 CE, Volume 1, p. 39.

³- See: Muhammad Abu Zahra, "History of Islamic Sects," Dar al-Fikr al-Arabi, Cairo, (undated), p. 80.

⁴- See: Al-Khalladi, Mahmoud, "Bay'ah in Islamic Political Thought," Al-Shihab Company, Algeria, (undated), p. 32

⁵- See: Al-Sanhoury, Abdul Razzaq Ahmad, "Fiqh of Caliphate and Its Evolution into a League of Eastern Nations," Edited by Tawfiq Muhammad al-Shawi and Nadiyya Abdul Razzaq al-Sanhoury, Al-Halabi Human Rights Publications, Beirut, Lebanon, 1st edition, 2008, p. 125. Also refer to Ibn Manzur, same reference, Volume 1, p. 752, entry "Nukhbah," where it states: "Al-Intikhab: The choice and selection; and from it is Al-Nukhbah, which is the chosen ones from the people... Al-Nukhbah, with a Dammah: Those selected from the people, those chosen. And in the hadith of Ibn al-Aqwa': 'He selected one hundred men from the people.'"

them as representatives of the nation? Or is it the general allegiance issued by the entire nation? Accordingly, the following definition can be formulated:

"Allegiance (Bay'ah) is a contract of satisfaction and choice that does not involve compulsion or coercion¹. It is undertaken by the majority of the nation or its representatives for the most qualified candidate to assume the presidency of the state."

From the justifications for adopting this definition are the following:

- Allegiance is a contractual agreement of satisfaction between the nation and the head of state, wherein both parties commit to its content. Moreover, it constitutes a more stringent and secure commitment on the part of the head of state, as Abu Zahra has asserted.
- The criterion for the validity of this contract is based on majority consensus, whether it is the majority of the general public or the majority of their representatives. In this sense, it aligns with the concept of election, as described by Al-Sanhuri.

Thirdly: The Shura Council and its relationship with the selection of the head of state.

Umar ibn Al-Khattab May Allah be pleased with him said: "Whoever gives allegiance to a man without the consultation of the Muslims, then he should not be followed, and neither should the one to whom the allegiance was given. They should both be killed out of fear that they may be killed²".

If it becomes necessary to discuss the implications of "shura" and its relationship to the process of selecting a head of state, as follows:

1- "Shura" in language and terminology:

A- "Shura" in language:

By referring to language dictionaries, we find that the term "shura" is derived from the verb "shoor." This verb and its derivatives carry several meanings, including: extracting honey from the honeycomb and collecting it from its cells and locations; presenting an animal for sale by riding or showcasing it to potential buyers; examining or assessing its condition; turning or directing it in a certain direction³.

¹ - See: Al-Mawardi, Abu al-Hasan Ali ibn Muhammad ibn Habib al-Basri al-Baghdadi, renowned as Al-Mawardi (d. 450 AH), "The Sultan's Edicts," Dar al-Hadith, Cairo, (undated), p. 26.

² - Refer to: Al-Bukhari, Abu Abdullah Muhammad ibn Ismail, "Sahih al-Bukhari," Edited and compiled by Ahmad Zuhayr and Ahmad Anaya, Dar al-Kitab al-Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon, 1432 AH/2011 CE, in the chapter "Stoning the Married Adulterer," Hadith number 6830, Volume 8, p. 168.

³ - See: Ibn Manzur, previous reference, Volume 4, pages 434, 436, and Al-Fayruzabadi, Muhammad ibn Abu Tahir ibn Muhammad ibn Ya'qub Al-Fayruzabadi, "Al-Qamus al-Muhit," edited by the Heritage Verification Office at the Institution of the Message, under the supervision of Muhammad Nuaim Al-Arqasusi, Institution of the Message for Printing, Publishing, and Distribution, Beirut, Lebanon, 8th edition, 1426 AH - 2005 CE, page 420.

a good appearance, form, or attire; indicating or directing something in a particular way; commanding or ordering someone to do something; seeking advice or consultation from someone¹.

From the above, it is evident that the prominent linguistic meanings revolve around presentation, examination, and extraction.

B- "Shura" in terminology:

Mohammed Abu Fares stated: "Shura means presenting differing opinions on an issue or matter, examining and turning various perspectives on it, and testing them among individuals with intellect and understanding, in order to arrive at what is correct or the most accurate and best solution. This is done so that it can be implemented to achieve the best desired results²".

Indeed, this definition of "Shura" seems to encompass all the linguistic meanings mentioned earlier, along with an explanation and elaboration of its process, starting from presenting differing opinions and reaching the extraction of the best results.

2. The Importance of "Shura"

The expression "And their affair is determined by consultation among themselves³" in the verse from Surah Ash-Shura indicates the generality of Shura. Thus, Shura covers all public and private matters in the lives of individuals and the community, and the rule is that anyone whose matter is at stake must seek consultation. This underscores its general and specific significance.

A- The importance of general consultation:

The importance of general consultation is manifested in its association with prayer, which is one of the greatest pillars of Islam after faith. Just as prayer remains obligatory regardless of circumstances, so does consultation. It is not a mere intellectual luxury to be applied based on agreement or disregarded entirely.

Sayyid Qutb commented on the verse 'And their affair is [determined by] consultation among themselves,' saying: 'The expression to make their entire affair one of consultation is intended to imbue all of life with this characteristic. This verse was revealed in Makkah before the establishment of the Islamic state... And the state is nothing but a natural extension of the Muslim community and its inherent qualities... Therefore, the characteristic of consultation within the community was present early on, more extensive and

¹ - See: Ibn Manzur, same reference, Volume 4, pages 434, 437.

² - Abu Fares, Muhammad Abd al-Qadir, "Al-Shura wa Qada'iy al-Ijtihad al-Jama'i," Al-Shihab Company, Sarawi Printing Press, Boumerdes, Algeria, (no publication date), pages 17-18.

³ - Verse 39, Surah Ash-Shura.

profound than the sphere of the state and its affairs. It is an inherent trait of Islamic life, a distinctive feature of the chosen community to lead humanity¹". "In the importance of consultation, various statements have been mentioned, including that it reveals the true nature, qualities, fairness, injustice, goodness, and evilness of individuals²".

"Likewise, it fosters unity within the community, serves as a measure of intellect, and leads to correctness³. Ali may God be pleased with him, also stated: 'In consultation, there are seven qualities: deriving the right decision, acquiring insight, safeguarding against mistakes, protecting oneself from blame, avoiding regret, fostering unity among hearts, and following the precedent⁴".

B- The Specific Importance of Consultation:

The particular significance of consultation pertains to the domain of the state and its governance, where consultation is realized through four fundamental aspects⁵:

- Involving the nation represented by its representatives in the management of its affairs and determining its destiny, alongside the ruler who also acts as its representative.
- Preventing the ruler from becoming autocratic or oppressive.
- Bridging the gap between the ruler and the ruled through cooperation, harmonizing hearts, and fostering collaboration to ensure successful governance, national progress, and prevention of revolutions.
- Averting errors in decision-making, as the entire nation is immune to error collectively, while no individual is immune within it.

3- The Scope of Consultation:

Is consultation applicable to all matters, or are there issues that involve consultation while others do not? The detailed answer to this is as follows⁶:

¹- See: Sayyid Qutb Ibrahim Hussein Al-Sharbi (d. 1385 AH), "In the Shadows of the Quran," Dar al-Shorouk, Beirut, Cairo, 17th edition, 1412 AH, Volume 5, page 3165.

²- See: Abu Salim Muhammad bin Talha Al-Qurashi Al-Nusaybi (d. 652 AH), "Al-Aqd Al-Fareed for King Al-Saeed," Al-Wahba Library, Cairo, undated, 1283 AH, page 50.

³- Al-Qurtubi, Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Ahmed bin Abi Bakr bin Farah Al-Ansari Al-Khazraji Shams al-Din Al-Qurtubi (d. 671 AH), "The Comprehensive Rulings of the Quran," edited by Ahmed Al-Bardouni and Ibrahim Atfich, Egyptian Book House, Cairo, 2nd edition, 1384 AH - 1964 AD, Volume 16, page 37.

⁴- Abu Salim Muhammad Al-Nusaybi, the aforementioned reference, page 42. See: Al-Bayati, Munir Hamid, "Islamic Systems," Wael Publishing and Distribution, Amman, Jordan, 1st edition, 2006 AD, pages 266-267.

⁵- See: Al-Bayati, Munir Hameed, "Al-Nizam Al-Islamiyyah" (Islamic Systems), Dar Wael for Publishing and Distribution, Amman, Jordan, 1st edition, 2006, pages 266-267.

⁶- See: Al-Samara'i, Naaman Abdul Razaq, "The Political System in Islam," King Fahd National Library, Riyadh, 2nd edition, 1421 AH - 2000 AD, page 171. And Al-Bayati, Hamid Munir, "The Islamic Political System Compared to the Legal State," Wael Publishing and Distribution, Amman, Jordan, 1st edition, 2003 AD, pages 185-186.

A- Matters that have definitive evidence from the Quran and Sunnah do not require consultation, but rather they require compliance and acceptance. The role of consultation does not extend to obstructing or interpreting such established texts.

B- As for issues that lack explicit evidence or have non-definitive evidence regarding their validity or implication, these are the realm of consultation and where it is applicable.

In conclusion, matters of governance and politics are governed by assessing benefits and preventing harm, and this is the vital domain of consultation by experts who possess knowledge of these issues.

Axis2: The Political dimensions in the election of Abu Bakr

Many orientalist writings have relied on weak and fabricated narratives found in historical sources that were not rigorously scrutinized during their compilation. When these narratives are discussed, their proponents often refer to their presence in sources like "Tarikh al-Tabari" and others. What are the main criticisms raised by these scholars regarding the legitimacy of Abu Bakr's allegiance? And what are the political implications extracted from addressing these criticisms?

First: Claims of Conspiracy and Political Division

1- Claim of Political Conspiracy:

Fellhawzen alleged that Abu Bakr and Umar were usurpers of the caliphate and had no legitimate right to it. He said, "Abu Bakr and Umar know that they did not assume the caliphate through legitimate means, but through usurpation. They were unable to legitimize their rule initially, only later attempting to cloak their leadership with legitimacy¹".

It is responded to by posing a crucial question: How do you acquire the legitimacy of a ruler in your view? Is it not through free choice by means of election²? Did not the Muslims choose their caliph using the same method? So why lament over legitimacy? Moreover, the text contradicts itself, either their rule is legitimate or not, from start to finish.

¹ - Fuhlhaouzen Julius: "History of the Arab State from the Emergence of Islam to the End of the Umayyad State," translated and annotated by Muhammad Abdel Hadi Abu Reida, and reviewed by Hussein Mu'nes, Committee for Compilation, Translation, and Publishing, Cairo, 2nd edition, 1968 AD, page 34. And refer to its translation by Al-Aqiqi Najib: "The Orientalists," Dar Al-Ma'arif, Egypt, 4th edition, Volume 2, page 387.

² - See: Al-Sanhoury, the aforementioned reference, considering that election and allegiance have the same meaning when he discusses the nature of election, page 125.

Lamens¹ claims that there was a tripartite agreement between Abu Bakr, Umar, and Abu Ubaidah to seize and rotate the caliphate, and this opinion, due to its absurdity and shallowness, was adopted by Muhammad Jamal al-Din Sarour when he says: "There is no doubt that these three individuals had contemplated the state of Muslims after the death of the Prophet. Therefore, we find their actions in the Saqifah meeting driven by a well-thought-out plan²".

However, a careful examination of authentic texts does not reveal any trace of these allegations. How could that be? The first to initiate the meeting were the Ansar, not these three individuals.

Kazanova³ claimed that the death of the Prophet was sudden, which led Abu Bakr to introduce two new verses and add them to the Quran in order to justify the new political situation⁴.

Ali ibn Abi Talib responded to this by saying, "The Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him, did not die suddenly. He suffered from an illness for several nights, and Bilal would come to him and call him to prayer. When the Messenger of Allah passed away, we, the Muhajirun and the Ansar, chose and selected among ourselves the one whom the Messenger of Allah had chosen for our religion. Prayer was of great importance, and it is the pillar of religion⁵".

Abu Bakr himself also responded to this claim, expressing his fear of interpreting the Quran without knowledge and of adding to it. He said, "Which heaven would cover me, and which earth would carry me if I said something about the Book of Allah without knowledge⁶".

2- Claim of Political Division:

¹- Amhazoun Muhammad: "Investigating the Stances of the Companions in the Fitnah from the Narrations of Imam Al-Tabari," Dar Al-Salam, Egypt, 2nd edition, 1428 AH / 2007 AD, page 18. And refer to its translation by Al-Aqiqi, the same reference, Volume 3, page 293.

²- See: Muhammad Jamal al-Din Sorour: "Political Life in the Arab and Islamic State during the First and Second Centuries After Hijra," Dar al-Fikr al-Arabi, Cairo, 5th edition, 1395 AH, pages 12-13

³- See: Al-Gindi Anwar Ibrahim Ali: "Taha Hussein: His Life and Thought in the Balance of Islam," Dar al-I'tisam, Egypt, 1st edition, 1396 AH, page 36. And refer to its translation by Al-Aqiqi, the aforementioned reference, Volume 1, page 219.

⁴- See: Al-Gindi Anwar, the same reference, pages 66-67.

⁵- Al-Dhahabi, Shams al-Din Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Uthman Al-Dhahabi (d. 748 AH): "History of Islam," edited by Umar Abdul Salam Tadmuri, Dar al-Kitab al-Arabi, Beirut, 2nd edition, 1410 AH, page 12.

⁶- Narrated by Ibn Abi Shaybah in "Al-Musannaf fi al-Ahadith wal Athar," Hadith number 30103, Ibn Abi Shaybah Abu Bakr Abdullah bin Muhammad, edited by Kamal Yusuf al-Hut, Maktabah al-Rushd, Riyadh, 1st edition, 1409 AH, Volume 6, page 136. Also narrated by al-Hafiz Ahmad bin Abi Bakr al-Busiri in "It'haf al-Khayrah al-Muhrah bi Zawaid al-Masanid al-Asharah," Book of Tafsir, chapter on how much of the Quran is recited, Dar al-Watan, 1420 AH, 6/114, and Ibn al-Qayyim: "Information about the Submitters to the Lord of the Worlds," Dar Ibn al-Jawzi, 1st edition, 1423 AH, 7/110.

And Brockelman claims that the companions, due to the Saqifah meeting, divided into multiple factions, some of whom view them as three: the Ansar(helpers), the Muhajirun(Emigrants), and the family of the Prophet (Ahl al-Bayt), and each faction tries with all its effort to gain power¹.

As for Abd al-Mun'im Majid, he says: "The Muslims divided into three groups after the death of the Prophet, each with its own candidate. The first group is the Ansar, the second group is the Muhajirun, and the third group is the Hashemites and a faction of the Umayyads²".

Some assess the positions of the companions as follows: "Ali ibn Abi Talib had a faction through which he sought to attain power, given his rightful claim to leadership due to his marriage to the Prophet's daughter and his close kinship. However, what hindered him from achieving this was his lack of sufficient strength to support his demand³".

As for the Ansar at the time of the Prophet's passing, they "made a strong move to secure their right to rule in their city, or at least to attain independence within it. However, they forgot that the city was no longer just theirs; it had become the city of the Prophet. They soon found themselves divided due to longstanding animosities among them and lost their numerical majority⁴".

In conclusion, one of the most significant political dimensions derived from the allegiance to Abu Bakr Al-Siddiq is the acquisition of political legitimacy by the ruler through free choice via election, along with the achievement of political harmony and unity among the various components of society and its leaders.

Secondly: Claims of Political Chaos and Power Struggle

1- Claim of Political Chaos

Suhail Zakkar portrays the city of Medina after the Prophet's death as being engulfed in chaos and turmoil, distracting people from his burial. He suggests that the reason he was buried where he passed away was due to the ongoing chaos and the nature of the environment that forced its people to bury him where he died⁵.

¹ - Brockelman, Carl: "History of Islamic Peoples," translated by Nabih Fares and Munir al-Baalbaki, Dar al-Ilm lil-Malayin, Beirut, 7th edition, 1977, page 83, and refer to its translation by Al-Aqiqi, the aforementioned reference, Volume 2, page 424.

² - See: Abd al-Mun'im Majid: "Political History of the Arab State," Anglo-Egyptian Library, 1st edition, 1965 AD, Volume 1, page 141.

³ - Brockelman: Same reference, page 83.

⁴ - Falahauzen: Previous reference, page 36.

⁵ - See: Zakar Suheil, "History of the Arabs and Islam from Before the Prophethood until the Fall of Baghdad," Dar al-Fikr, 3rd edition, 1399 AH, page 64.

This claim is refuted due to the author's ignorance, as the burial places of prophets are explicitly determined by religious law, contrary to what he alleged, as stated by the Prophet: "No prophet dies except he is buried where he died"¹.

Some Orientalists claim that when the issue of succession after the Prophet arose, the companions did not find a governing system in the Quran and Sunnah that they could apply in their lives. Therefore, they resorted to the pre-Islamic era's method of selecting a leader – the eldest in age. This leader was Abu Bakr, may Allah be pleased with him, according to the opinion of Thomas Arnold².

And there are those who say, "I wish the Quran and Sunnah had left specific legislation for the system of governance in the state, which the companions could apply and the Muslims could follow after the Prophet"³.

And Thomas Arnold also said, "Why didn't the Prophet appoint a successor? It is futile to inquire why he neglected it despite his genius in organization, to safeguard the future of the modern religious community he established... Perhaps he was confused in his body and mind in his final days"⁴.

Despite the insinuations in his words that are not innocent towards the Prophet, the best response to him and what was mentioned earlier is the words of the impartial, like Marcel Boisard - the contemporary French thinker and legal scholar, author of the book "Humanity of Islam" - when he said: "Among the things that must be rejected is the repeated claim in the West, thousands of times, of Islam's inability to develop a dynamic political system. History emphatically and decisively refutes this"⁵.

It is also refuted by what Ibn Taymiyyah said: The selection of Abu Bakr after the Prophet is among the signs of Prophethood. It has been the custom of people that the ruling authority goes to the tribe of the ruler or his relatives, or because the large tribe with its numbers, wealth, and influence is the one that governs.

¹- It was narrated by Ibn Majah in his Sunan, in the chapter "Mentioning His Death and Burial," from Abu Bakr, Hadith number: 1628. Ibn Majah, Muhammad bin Yazid al-Qazwini, Sunan Ibn Majah, Dar al-Ilm wal Hikm, Cairo, 1st edition, 1432 AH, 2011, page 268. He said: weak. Ibn Hajar, same reference, Volume 1, page 529. And it was also narrated by Abu Ya'la in his Musnad, in the Musnad of Abu Bakr al-Siddiq, number: 22, Musnad Abu Ya'la, edited by Hussein Salim Assad, Dar al-Ma'moon lil-Turath, Damascus, 1st edition, 1404 AH, 1984, 1/31.

²- See: Thomas Arnold: "The Caliphate," translated by Jameel Maali, Dar al-Yaqza, Damascus, page 8.

³- Muhammad Amin Saleh: "The Arabs and Islam from the Prophetic Mission to the End of the Umayyad Caliphate," ...p.127

⁴- See Thomas Arnold: Same reference, page 119.

⁵- See: Imad al-Din Khalil, "They Said About Islam," World Youth Islamic Conference, Riyadh, 1st edition, 1412 AH, page 64.

2- The claim of a power struggle:

The Orientalists, following their customary approach of distorting Islamic history, depict the events at the Saqifah as a power struggle, drawing comparisons to their own medieval kings and emperors, considering it as human desires embellished.

Fuhlhaugen suggests that the companions swiftly took hold of power due to the Prophet's passing, which he claims nullified religious authority. He states: "It seems that the Prophet's death annulled religious authority, and the Arab tribes apostatized. Since there was no established order as to who would succeed the Prophet, the only way was for someone to quickly seize power¹".

Suhayl Zakar, on the other hand, remarks: "It appears that the Arab apostasy that spread when news of the Prophet's death reached them contributed to the success of the Saqifah coup²".

Despite the contradictory claims made by Fuhlhaugen and Zakar regarding the events at the Saqifah, the most pertinent response to the aforementioned is to examine the actions and statements of Abu Bakr himself. He was chosen by that generation of companions during the Saqifah and upon the Prophet's passing.

After three days of his pledge of allegiance, Abu Bakr asked: "Who will relieve me of this burden of leadership?" To this, Ali responded: "By Allah, we will not relieve you nor allow you to resign. Who would replace you, when the Messenger of Allah himself selected you³?"

He also said, "By Allah, I was never eager for leadership, not during the day or the night. I never desired it, nor did I ask Allah for it in secret or openly. But I feared the turmoil⁴".

¹- Fahlhauzen: Previous reference, page 33.

²- Zakar Suheil, same reference, page 70.

³- Al-Baladhuri, Ahmed bin Yahya bin Jabir al-Baladhuri (d. 279 AH / 892 CE), "Anṣāb al-Ashrāf" (Lineage of the Nobles), edited and introduced by Suheil Zakar and Riyad Zarkali, Dar al-Fikr, Beirut, Lebanon, 1st edition, 1417 AH / 1996 CE, 2/772. And see: Ibn Qutaybah: "Imamah wa al-Siyasah" (Leadership and Politics), 1/24-25. It should be noted that this book is attributed to Ibn Qutaybah al-Dinawari (d. 276 AH), but its attribution to him is uncertain, and it is more likely that it has been falsely attributed to him, with the author being unknown.

⁴- See: Ibn Kathir, Imad al-Din Abu al-Fida' Ismail ibn Umar ibn Kathir al-Qurashi al-Dimashqi (701-774 AH), "Al-Bidaya wa'l-Nihaya" (The Beginning and the End), edited by Abdullah bin Abdulmohsin Al-Turki, Dar Hijr, Giza, Egypt, 1st edition, 1418 AH / 1997 CE, 6/419. And al-Dhahabi, same reference, (The Rightly Guided Caliphs), page 8. And al-Bayhaqi, Abu Bakr Ahmed ibn al-Hussein (384-458 AH), "Dala'il al-Nubuwwah" (Signs of Prophethood), verified and annotated by Abdul Ma'ti Qalaji, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, and Dar al-Rayan for Heritage, Cairo, 1st edition, 1408 AH / 1988 CE, 3/70. And al-Bayhaqi, Ahmed ibn al-Hussein ibn Ali ibn Musa al-Khurasani Abu Bakr al-Bayhaqi (458 AH), "Al-Sunan al-Kubra" (The Major Hadith Compilation), verified by Muhammad Abdul Qadir Ata, Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, 3rd edition, 1424 AH / 2003 CE, 8/153.

His attitudes upon his death are numerous, summarized by his daughter, the Mother of the Believers Aisha. One of them is when Abu Bakr said, "Look at what has been added to my wealth since I assumed the Caliphate. Send it to the Khalifa after me." So we looked, and there was a Nubian slave carrying his children, and a milk camel tending to his garden. We sent them to Umar, and he said, "Mercy be upon Abu Bakr. He has exhausted himself greatly after me¹".

Indeed, Abu Bakr's request to be relieved of the position does not indicate a love for power, but rather a detachment from it. The response of the majority of the companions when they said, "We will not remove you, nor will we resign you," suggests that this was the consensus opinion of the companions who chose him. It was not solely Ali's personal opinion. If they had seen any inclination towards worldly gain in him, they would have refrained from supporting him.

Furthermore, the fact that a man who was among the wealthiest of Arab elites before Islam, left behind only a slave and a camel upon his death, speaks volumes about his lack of attachment to power. During that era, power was not seen as a prize but as a burden. If any of them had wished that someone else would take on its responsibilities, it was due to their awareness of the gravity of the position and their fear of being held accountable by Allah.

Conclusion:

The research has yielded significant insights, particularly concerning the political implications and dimensions in the selection of a head of state. The following conclusions can be drawn:

1. The contemporary political significance of a state primarily revolves around its citizens' ownership, in contrast to the imperial eras where territories were defined by the reach of their armies.
2. The title of "head of state" refers to the individual with the highest executive authority in leading and managing the state. Their selection is achieved through a process of choosing and favoring the best candidate based on free popular will.
3. The act of allegiance (bay'ah) represents a voluntary contract between the people and the head of state. Both parties are bound by its terms, which holds

¹- Ibn Abi Shaybah, "Al-Musannaf," Book of Journeys, Chapter: What They Said About the Justice of the Governor, Hadith number 32215. And see al-Ayni, "Umdat al-Qari," 11/264, narrated by Aisha, and its chain of narration is authentic. And see: al-Salabi, "Siyarat Amir al-Mu'minin Abu Bakr" (Biography of the Commander of the Faithful Abu Bakr), Dar Ibn al-Jawzi, Cairo, 1st edition, 1428 AH / 2007 CE, pages 328-329.

a stronger commitment from the head of state. Its criterion is the majority, whether the majority of the nation's population or the majority of its representatives, and it is essentially a form of election.

4. The principle of mutual consultation (Shura) is obligatory for the entire community in all matters, especially in issues lacking clear textual guidance. It is based on the general verse, "And their affairs are decided by consultation among themselves." This is especially significant in the selection of a head of state, as it is a crucial political aspect in establishing their legitimacy.

5. From the political implications derived from Abu Bakr's appointment, it is evident that a ruler's political legitimacy is not achieved through seizing power or coercion, but rather through a free election process, unity among societal components, and the consent of its leaders.

6. Abu Bakr's selection holds valuable lessons and political values for generations of Muslims, including the importance of freedom of opinion, refraining from governance without proper authority, and the significance of mutual consultation in building and selecting legitimate authority. The absence of an explicit text on caliphate for any individual emphasizes that political matters are branches of religion, not its fundamental principles.

7. The rejection by fair-minded scholars of the repeated claims in the West about Islam's inability to develop a dynamic political system is categorically contradicted by history.

8. The concept of a political system is inherent in Islam, and there is no justification for denying or separating it from the religion due to a lack of explicit texts on political matters. The issue lies not in the absence of such texts, but in their misunderstanding or intentional neglect.

9. Abu Bakr's biography and actions stand in contradiction to a love for power and the scramble for it. His conduct embodies a significant political dimension that modern constitutions have adopted—the tribal and communal oversight of financial integrity when assuming high offices within the state.

The sources and references :

1. Amhazoun, Muhammad. "Investigation of the Positions of the Companions in the Fitnah According to the Narrations of Imam al-Tabari." Dar al-Salam, Egypt, 2nd edition, 1428 AH/2007 AD.

2. Al-Bukhari, Abu Abdullah Muhammad ibn Ismail. "Sahih al-Bukhari." Edited and Authenticated by Ahmad Zuhwa and Ahmad Anaya. Dar al-Kitab al-Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon, 1432 AH/2011 AD.

3. Al-Bayhaqi, Abu Bakr Ahmad ibn al-Husayn. "Proofs of Prophethood." Documented, Compiled, and Annotated by Abd al-Muti Qalaji. Dar al-Kutub

al-Ilmiyyah, Beirut, and Dar al-Rayyan for Heritage, Cairo, 1st edition, 1408 AH/1988 AD.

4. Al-Bayhaqi, Ahmad ibn al-Husayn ibn Ali ibn Musa al-Khusrawjirdi al-Khurasani, Abu Bakr. "Al-Sunan al-Kubra." Edited by Muhammad Abd al-Qadir Ata. Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah, Beirut, Lebanon, 3rd edition, 1424 AH/2003 AD.

5. Al-Baladhuri, Ahmad ibn Yahya ibn Jabir. "Anis al-Ashraf." Edited and Introduced by Suheil Zakar and Riyad Zarkali. Dar al-Fikr, Beirut, Lebanon, 1st edition, 1417 AH/1996 AD.

6. Al-Bayati, Munir Hamid. "Islamic Systems." Dar Wael for Publishing and Distribution, Amman, Jordan, 1st edition, 2006 AD.

7. Al-Bayati, Hamid Munir. "Islamic Political System Compared to the Legal State." Dar Wael for Publishing and Distribution, Amman, Jordan, 1st edition, 2003 AD.

8. Brockelman, Carl. "History of Islamic Peoples." Translated by Nabi Fares and Munir al-Ba'lbaki. Dar al-Ilm for Millions, Beirut, 7th edition, 1977.

9. Al-Busiri, Ahmad ibn Abi Bakr ibn Ismail. "Ithaf al-Khayrah al-Muhrah bi Zawaid al-Masaneed al-Asharah." Book of Tafsir, Chapter: How Much of the Quran to Recite. Dar al-Watan, 1420 AH/1999 AD.

10. Thomas Arnold. "The Caliphate." Translated by Jamil Ma'li. Dar al-Yaqza, Damascus.

11. Al-Jindi, Anwar Ibrahim al-Ali. "Taha Hussein: His Life and Thought in the Balance of Islam." Dar al-I'tisam, Egypt, 1st edition, 1396 AH.

12. Al-Hakim, Abu Abdullah Al-Hakim Al-Naysaburi. "Al-Mustadrak ala al-Sahihayn." Dar al-Haramayn, Cairo, 1st edition, 1417 AH/1997 AD.

13. Al-Khaldi, Mahmoud. "Al-Bayah in Islamic Political Thought." Al-Shihab Company, Algeria, (No edition specified), 1988 AD.

14. Al-Dhahabi, Shams al-Din Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Uthman. "History of Islam." Researched by Omar Abd al-Salam Tadmuri. Dar al-Kitab al-Arabi, Beirut, 2nd edition, 1410 AH/1990 AD.

15. Zakar, Suheil. "History of the Arabs and Islam from Before the Prophethood until the Fall of Baghdad." Dar al-Fikr, 3rd edition, 1399 AH.

16. Abu Zahra, Muhammad. "History of Islamic Schools of Thought." Dar al-Fikr al-Arabi, Cairo, (No edition specified), (No date specified).

17. Sayyid Qutb, Ibrahim Hussein al-Sharbi. "In the Shade of the Quran." Dar al-Shorouk, Beirut, Cairo, 17th edition, 1412 AH.

18. Abu Salam, Muhammad ibn Talha al-Qurashi al-Nasibi. "Al-Iqd al-Fareed li-Malik al-Sa'id." Al-Maktaba al-Wahbiyya, Cairo, (No edition specified), 1283 AH.
19. Al-Samirai, Naaman Abd al-Razzaq. "The Political System in Islam." King Fahd National Library, Riyadh, 2nd edition, 1421 AH/2000 AD.
20. Al-Sinhoury, Abdul Razzaq Ahmad. "Jurisprudence of the Caliphate and Its Development into an Eastern League of Nations." Researched by Tawfiq Muhammad al-Shawi and Nadia Abdul Razzaq al-Sinhoury. Halabi Human Rights Publications, Beirut, Lebanon, 1st edition, 2008 AD.
21. Ibn Abi Shaybah, Abu Bakr Abdullah ibn Muhammad. "Al-Musannaf fi al-Ahadith wa al-Athar." Researched by Kamal Yusuf al-Hawt. Maktaba al-Rushd, Riyadh, 1st edition, 1409 AH.
22. Al-Salabi, Muhammad Ali al-Salabi. "Biography of the Commander of the Faithful Abu Bakr." Dar Ibn al-Jawzi, Cairo, 1st edition, 1428 AH/2007 AD.
23. Majid, Abdul Munim. "Political History of the Arab State." Anglo-Egyptian Library, 1st edition, 1965 AD.
24. Al-Aqqi, Najib. "The Orientalists." Dar al-Maaref, Egypt, 4th edition.
25. Khalil, Imad al-Din. "They Said About Islam." World Assembly of Muslim Youth, Riyadh, 1st edition, 1412 AH.
26. Abu Fares, Muhammad Abdul Qadir. "Consultation and Issues of Collective Ijtihad." Al-Shihab Company, Sarawi Press, Boumerdes, Algeria, (No edition specified), (No date specified).
27. Fürtwangler, Julius von. "History of the Arab State from the Emergence of Islam to the End of the Umayyad State." Translated from German and Annotated by Muhammad Abd al-Hadi Abu Rida. Reviewed by Husayn Muwannis. Publication, Translation, and Publishing Committee, Cairo, 2nd edition, 1968 AD.
28. Al-Fayruzabadi, Muhammad ibn Abi Tahir ibn Muhammad ibn Ya'qub. "Al-Qamus al-Muhit." Researched by the Heritage Verification Office at Dar al-Risalah, supervised by Muhammad Naim al-Arqousi. Dar al-Risalah for Printing, Publishing, and Distribution, Beirut, Lebanon, 8th edition, 1426 AH/2005 AD.
29. Ibn Qutaybah, Abu Abdullah Muhammad ibn Muslim ibn Qutaybah al-Dinawari. "Al-Imamah wa al-Siyasah." Researched by Khalil Mansour. Dar al-Kitab al-Ilmiyyah, 1418 AH/1997 AD, Beirut, Lebanon.
30. Al-Qurtubi, Abu Abdullah Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Abu Bakr ibn Farah al-Ansari al-Khazraji Shams al-Din. "Al-Jami li Ahkam al-Quran."

Researched by Ahmad al-Bardouni and Ibrahim Atfish. Dar al-Kutub al-Misriyya, Cairo, 2nd edition, 1384 AH/1964 AD.

31. Al-Qalqashandi, Ahmed ibn Ali ibn Ahmed Al-Fazari Al-Qalqashandi then Al-Qahiri. "Maathir al-Anaqah fi Maalam al-Khilafah." Researched by Abdul Sattar Ahmed Faraj. Kuwait Government Press, Kuwait, 2nd edition, 1985 AD.

32. Ibn al-Qayyim. "Information for Those Who Are Observant about the Lord of the Worlds." Dar Ibn al-Jawzi, 1st edition, 1423 AH.

33. Ibn Majah, Muhammad ibn Yazid al-Qazwini. "Sunan Ibn Majah." Dar al-Ilm wa al-Hikm, Cairo, 1st edition, 1432 AH/2011 AD.

34. Ibn Kathir, Imad al-Din Abu al-Fida Ismail ibn Umar ibn Kathir al-Qurashi al-Dimashqi. "Al-Bidaya wa al-Nihaya." Researched by Abdullah ibn Abdul Mohsen al-Turki. Dar Hajar, Giza, Egypt, 1st edition, 1418 AH/1997 AD.

35. Muhammad Amin Saleh. "The Arabs and Islam from the Prophetic Mission to the End of the Umayyad Caliphate."

36. Muhammad Jamal al-Din Sarur. "Political Life in the Arab and Islamic State During the First and Second Centuries After the Hijra." Dar al-Fikr al-Arabi, Cairo, 5th edition, 1395 AH.

37. Al-Mawardi, Abu al-Hasan Ali ibn Muhammad ibn Habib al-Basri al-Baghdadi. "Al-Ahkam al-Sultaniyya." Dar al-Hadith, Cairo, (No edition specified), (No date specified).

38. Ibn Manzur, Muhammad ibn Mukarram ibn Ali, Abu al-Fadl, Jamal al-Din Ibn Manzur al-Ansari al-Ruwayfi'i al-Afriqi. "Lisan al-Arab." Dar Sader, Beirut, 3rd edition, 1414 AH.

39. Abu Ya'la. "Musnad Abu Ya'la." Researched by Hussein Salim Assad. Dar al-Mamun for Heritage, Damascus, 1st edition, 1404 AH/1984 AD.

40. "The State: Its Definition, Its Pillars, Its Legal Foundations, and Guarantees for Its Achievement." Article published on Monday, December 12, 2011, on the website <http://nehroes.blogspot.com>. Date of access: 01/02/2022, Time: 14:44.