Review Article

Indonesia Counselee' Perception of Counseling Variables in Relation to Counseling Outcomes

Muwakhidah Muwakhidah[1*], Nur Hidayah[2], Triyono triyono[3], Carolina Ligya Radjah[4]

[1]*Student, Department of Guidance and Counseling, Faculty of Education, Universitas Negeri Malang, East Java, Indonesia*

[2]*Professor, Department of Guidance and Counseling, Faculty of Education, Universitas Negeri Malang, East Java, Indonesia*

[3]*Doctor, Department of Guidance and Counseling, Faculty of Education, Universitas Negeri Malang, East Java, Indonesia*

[4]*Doctor, Department of Instructional Technology, Faculty of Education, Universitas Negeri Malang, East Java, Indonesia*

*Correspondence to: Muwakhidah Muwakhidah, Student, Department of Guidance and Counseling, Faculty of Education, Universitas Negeri Malang, East Java, Indonesia

Email: muwakhidah.1601119@students.um.ac.id; ORCID no: 0000-0002-4133-706

Abstract

The purpose of study was to examine counselee's perception of the influence of the chosen counseling variable on results of counseling: the attractiveness of counseling, skills, and ethical practices. Collect data used the Counselor Rating Form Short Version and Integrated Counseling Behavior Change Scale. Data analyzed using descriptive and inferential analysis. Mean score, standard deviation and percentage calculated to examine counseling outcomes, t-test, ANOVA, and correlation were calculated to test hypothesis. Counselor's attractiveness, skills, and ethical practice were all found to correlate positively with the counseling outcomes. The Implications of research for counseling practices and future research are also discussed.

Keywords: counselor's attractiveness, ethical practice, counseling outcomes.

Introduction

Counselee perceptions of their counselors during counseling sessions have been found to influence counselee behavioral change, or at least the counselee's positive attitude toward the counseling session (Kendall & Norton-Ford, 1982; Kivlighan, 2008; Kwon & Jo, 2012; Seo, 2011). The findings from the following research results show that counselors need to be prepared to present themselves as people who try hard, keep on changing, willing to take risks, evaluate themselves, and problem solvers, as well as people who experience all the typical human emotions, such as sadness, competent but imperfect, mature, stable, face all difficulties with perseverance, and continue to learn and develop (Corey, 2015; Gilliland et al., 1983; Nurlatifah, 2018)

Studies on counselors' effectiveness as perceived by clients started when Strong (1968; 1988) introduced a model, which he adapted from the communication model, explaining how the client's perception of the counselor influences client behavior in counseling sessions. He proposed three characteristics of the counselor, namely attractiveness, expertise and trust, as variables related to the effectiveness of the counselor. Strong further explained attractiveness as displaying compatibility with the client, by reassuring the client that the counselor will be likeable. Expertness related to further training, this has been proven for counselees. This can also be shown through the counselors presenting themselves in a sensible and self-assured manner. Trustworthiness involves the counselor's standing for truthfulness and kindness, with a demonstration of openness and genuineness, and being perceived as having no interest in personal gain. In his theory, Strong also includes counselee characteristics and communication characteristics as factors that influence the outcome of counseling.

Strong's proposed model has generated several studies on counselor characteristics and their influence on counselee behavioral changes or counseling outcomes, looked at in various settings and from various perspectives. In 1975, LaCrosse and Barak (Corrigan & Schmidt, 1983) developed a 36-item measurement to assess the three counselor characteristics proposed by Strong, and subsequently used by many researchers in their studies to examine perceived counselor effectiveness (Lin, 2001; Nerison & Claiborn, 1990; Stein, 1981).

The three characteristics of the counselor put forward by Strong have been further examined in terms of what constitutes each characteristic. For example, in Stein's (1981) study, the counselor's verbal communication style was rated higher for expertise if he did not have a south American accent, compared to a counselor with such an accent. Nerison and Claiborn (1990) confirmed Stein's finding regarding verbal communication, with the additional information that the counselors' non-verbal cues had greater influence than their verbal behaviors

A counselor's attractiveness can be determined by his or her emotional intelligence (Nurlatifah, 2018) which comprises two competencies: personal and social competence. These two competencies encompass five domains: self-awareness, self-regulation, self-motivation, empathy and social skills (Nurlatifah, 2018; Salleh et al, 2010). Personal quality or personal ability is a core condition that facilitates the treatment process (Feller & Cottone, 2003; Lambert & Barley, 2001). It means absolutely for every counselor to hone and forge themselves to be able to foster a personal therapeutic attitude to facilitate the changing of counselee. Because the therapeutic personal attitude of a counselor is a sufficient condition in the counseling process (Ellingham, 1999; Gatongi, 2007; Moon, 2007; Cornelius-White & Carver, 2012).

In a humanistic view, there are several attitudes or personal qualities that need to be possessed by a counselor to realize an effective counseling process, namely empathy understanding, respect, and genuines (Rogers, 1969 in Corey, 2015). Having empathy allows counselors to understand counselees by identifying their feelings, by actively listening to the expression of their feelings, in addition to considering their behavior and emotions (Gilliland et al., 1983). Studies conducted by Lynch (Lynch, 2012) report that empathy is one of the factors that influence successful counseling outcomes. Wilkins and Bozarth explain that empathy is considered important in successful therapy, because when an empathetic attitude is felt by the counselee the main effect is considered a viable contra condition (Wilkins & Bozarth, 2001). Hall and Lindzey claims that the empathy attitude of the counselor encourages the counselee to explore conscious feelings to bring them to awareness (Hall & Lindzey, 1970). While Nerison et

al. (1990) found that physical appearance was felt by the counselee as an element of attraction even though it was positively correlated with session effectiveness.

A counselor's perceived self-efficacy was also found to draw the client closer to the counselor in a counseling session. A counselor with high self-efficacy is able to distinguish how the counselee feels, thinks, acts and is motivated, therefore he has the qualities that can influence the counselee's decision, and he is also able to overcome the experience of failure (Wahyuni & Prakoso, 2015; Sheu et al, 2012). In addition, the counselor's own holistic wellbeing has been found to empower the counselor to give more effective counseling sessions. Counselors who emphasize their own overall health, including the emotional, social, intellectual, career, spiritual and physical dimensions, have the capacity to prevent their own illness by using various approaches and treatments. This can prove to be an effective intervention in restoring clients' own wellbeing when they are suffering from psychosomatic disorders, depression, obesity, stress and passivity (Yuliani, 2018).

Moving on from the aspect of attractiveness, expertise or expertise of the counselor, asked to understand by Strong, is also an important dimension and is needed in their advanced training. This will include the counselor's mastery of the theories pertinent to the counseling session (Sarwono, 2018). The counselor's knowledge of theory is closely related to his or her level of education and experience in providing counseling services. Counselors of a higher education level have a better grasp of the various theories and are able to apply them more effectively. However, the counselor's chosen approach was found to have different impacts on clients' perceptions of counselor effectiveness. Lin (2001) found that those counselors using Relationship-Centered Counseling were perceived to be more effective that those using Client-Centered and Problem-Solving counseling approaches among Korean female clients. Seo (2011) discovered that the counselor's choice of emphasis between the client's ego-focused emotions and the client's other-focused emotions showed a different impact on client-perceived counselor effectiveness depending on clients' characteristics and their cultural background. Quite apart from the advanced skills and techniques, the use of basic counseling skills not only allows smooth session progress but is also applicable in various counseling situations (Mahadita et al, 2017).

Counselors who practice ethical and professional standards are able to predict a client's response, and consequently increase the client's trust and understanding of the counseling process; clients will be more enthusiastic about offering additional information, thereby contributing towards the prevention of and rehabilitation from their problems (Ivey et al., 2010). This practice also creates awareness of personal needs, overcoming unresolved problems, and the potential for personal conflict and defense. Nerison et al. (1990) discovered that trustworthiness was positively related to counseling session impact, to the quality of the therapeutic session, and to clients' feelings about the session. The issue of confidentiality is an important issue in building ethical practices, because it is needed to build trust and productive counselee-therapist relationships. Therefore, it is very important for counselors to discuss this issue with the counselee at the beginning of the counseling session (Corey, 2015).

Trust in the aid relationship will increase the effectiveness of interpersonal communication in the assistance process, because it communicates with the channel, clarifies the delivery and receiving of messages, and adds opportunities to achieve the purpose of the communication. The counselor's trust in the counselee and vice versa is very important, to show openness, the counselor must get the trust of the counselee and the counselee must get the trust of the counselor.

The belief that he will be heard, accept each other as he is, believe that all conflicts will be resolved together (Brammer, 1973).

With regard to the experience of the counselor, a study by Kwon and Jo (2012) shows that the level of counselor experience, empathic accuracy, and counseling results are all positively correlated. Counselor experience level was found to affect counseling outcomes through the effects of empathic accuracy. Both routes, from counselor experience level to empathic accuracy, and from empathic accuracy to counseling outcome, were significant. Even among counselor trainees, Kivlighan (2008) found that when trainees' intended structure was similar to that of the experienced counselors, their clients rated their counseling sessions as going more smoothly and exploring more deeply. The mixed findings perhaps require further inquiry.

The literature has shown strong support for the influence of interpersonal skills on counselor effectiveness in counseling sessions. However, in Indonesia, research on counselees' perceptions about their counselor, or counseling process, is very limited, not only in numbers but also in the area of focus. Most previous studies relied on qualitative methods based solely on the counselor's report or interviews with the counselor. This study hopes to fill the gap in understanding of the effectiveness of face-to-face counseling in the Indonesian context.

This research was conducted based on the interpersonal influence model proposed by Strong (1968). This psychological model recognizes the concept of counselee transformation through support services. According to Strong, the interpersonal influence model involves two stages; namely the counselee's perception and the role of the counselor in maximizing their influence on the counselee's transformation. Every transformation experienced by the counselee in relation to the problem is very closely related to the encouragement they receive from the counselee's counselee interaction. This impulse depends on the attractiveness, appearance, skills, expertise, trust, and so on of the counselor. The counselee's perception of the counselor's attributes is an important aspect of interpersonal influence theory. The counselor's character that is expressed during the communication process, presentation style and interaction process will contribute more as a healing factor for the counselee than the resources that are in the counselee itself.

Overall, based on relevant previous research, many aspects that influence the counselee's involvement in the counseling session have been explored, including emotional intelligence, self-efficacy and holistic well-being of the counselor. In addition, the counselor's theoretical application skills, counseling skills and ethical practice have been examined. In most cases studies of counseling practices in Indonesia are mostly examined through the counselor's lens. All of these aspects need to be emphasized because they impact on positive changes in counselee behavior and in achieving session goals. However, the extent of the relationship between attractiveness, skills and ethical practices of a counselor and the effects they have on counseling sessions from the counselee's perspective has not been identified. Therefore, this study will investigate the effects of counseling sessions and identify the relationship between counselor attractiveness, skills and ethical practices and the effects of counseling sessions on counselees. In addition, this research will cover the demographic aspects of the counselor's experience because it can influence the counselee after the counseling session.

Research purposes

The purpose of this study is to understand the qualities of counselor attractiveness, skills and ethical practices. This study focuses on observing their effects on the counseling session as experienced by

the counselee, and also on identifying the relationship between the counselor's attractiveness, skills and ethical practices, and their effects on counselee counseling. In addition, this study also examines the counselor' experience as it may affect the counselee after the counseling session. We hypothesize that, as indicated in the literature, there is a significant relationship between counselors' attractiveness, their skills, ethical practices and experience, and counseling effectiveness as perceived by the counselee.

Research Design

This study uses a survey design and a quantitative approach to investigate the relationship between counselors' attractiveness, skills and ethical practices and the effects of the counseling session on the client. In addition, the demographic aspects of counselor gender and service experience are surveyed in this study.

Participants

Participants in this study were 198 students from 22 high schools in Surabaya, East Java, Indonesia. 198 students were selected as research participants or participants through selection using criteria: 1) have followed the counseling process at least five times, 2) each process had a minimum of three counseling sessions. These students or counselees come from different backgrounds in terms of gender, age and race. The participants details are as follows:

Instrument

The research instrument used in the study is a questionnaire consisting of three sections, Sections A, B and C. Section A elicits counselees' demographic information. Section B measures the counselor's attractiveness, skills and ethical practices, while Section C assesses the effects of the counseling session on the counselee. Section B factors are measured using the new version (Corrigan & Schmidt, 1983) of Barak and LaCrosse's (1975) Counselor Rating Form-Short Version (CRF-S). Section C, measuring counseling effectiveness, uses six items.

The CRF-S, is a 12-item scale, measuring a counselor's level of attractiveness, expertness, and trustworthiness. Each dimension is assessed by four items. For attractiveness counselees are asked to evaluate their counselor's friendliness, likeability, sociability and warmth. The four items measuring expertness require counselees to rate the counselor's expertness based on experience, expertise, skills and preparedness. The third dimension, trustworthiness, is rated against items such as honesty, trustworthy, reliability and sincerity. Ratings are assigned using a seven-point Likert type scale (1 = not very, 7 = very), thus producing possible scores from 12 to 84. The CRF-S internal consistency reliability coefficient (Cronbach's alpha) for the expertness dimension is .90, for the trustworthiness dimension is .84, and for the attractiveness dimension is .92 (Lin, 2001). The instrument validity as determineed through factor analysis found well-defined loadings among the three scales (Corrigan & Schmidt, 1983; Ponterotto & Furlong, 1985).

Counseling outcomes were measured by six items evaluating the influence of the counseling session on the counselees' growth in term of their understanding of their own and others' behaviors, as well as their environment. The alpha reliability index for both the CRF-S and the outcomes scale for the present study is in the range of .87 to .91 for each dimension of both scales.

Data Analysis

This research is included in a quantitative research with a descriptive approach. (Average and standard deviation) The validity and reliability have been analyzed and analyzed by different experts. Data analysis uses t-tes and ANOVA to see significant relationship between the attractiveness of counselors, their skills, ethical practices and experiences, and the effectiveness of counseling as perceived by the counselee. The results of the research data were analyzed using SPSS 26.0 statistical tools with a statistical significance value of 0.05.

Results

Table 1 shows that 88,9% or 176 respondents agreed that the counseling session made them think more clearly, 87,9% or 174 respondents said that the counseling helped them to behave better, while 84,8% or 168 respondents agreed that counseling helped to understand their feelings and, to understand others. Some 86,9% or 172 respondents agreed with the statement that the counseling session helped them understand the situation and environment they were in, and 88,3% or 175 respondents would recommend counseling sessions to others. The breakdown, based on level of agreement, is shown in the following table (Table 2):

Relationship Between Counselors' Attractiveness and Effects of Counseling Sessions

Results from the analysis using the Pearson correlation method show that there is a significant relationship between a counselor's attractiveness and the effects of the counseling session on the counselee ($r = 0.81$, $p < .05$). The better the appearance, temperament and personality of the counselor, the higher the counselee's confidence, resulting in a positive effect on the session outcomes. The results can be seen in Table 4.

Relationship Between Counselors' Skills and Effects of Counseling Sessions

Results from the analysis show that there is a significant relationship between the counselor's skills and the effects of the counseling session

Table 1. Participants Descriptions by School and Gender

School	Gender		N
	Male	Female	
SMA Negeri 1 Surabaya	4	5	9
SMA Negeri 2 Surabaya	3	6	9
SMA Negeri 3 Surabaya	5	3	8
SMA Negeri 4 Surabaya	4	7	11
SMA Negeri 5 Surabaya	3	7	10
SMA Negeri 6 Surabaya	4	4	8
SMA Negeri 7 Surabaya	4	5	9
SMA Negeri 8 Surabaya	4	5	9
SMA Negeri 9 Surabaya	5	4	9
SMA Negeri 10 Surabaya	3	6	9
SMA Negeri 11 Surabaya	5	4	9
SMA Negeri 12 Surabaya	4	6	10
SMA Negeri 13 Surabaya	4	5	9
SMA Negeri 14 Surabaya	3	5	8
SMA Negeri 15 Surabaya	4	4	8
SMA Negeri 16 Surabaya	3	5	8
SMA Negeri 17 Surabaya	5	4	9
SMA Negeri 18 Surabaya	4	4	8
SMA Negeri 19 Surabaya	4	6	10
SMA Negeri 20 Surabaya	3	6	9
SMA Negeri 21 Surabaya	4	5	9
SMA Negeri 22 Surabaya	4	6	10
Total	86	112	198

on the counselee (r = 0.876, p < 0.01). This means that the higher the skills of a counselor, the higher the positive outcomes for a counselee from a counseling session. These results are presented in Table 4.

Relationship Between Counselors' Ethical Practices and Effects on Counseling Sessions

There is a significant relationship between these two variables (r = .792, p < .01). The better the ethical practices of a counselor, the more encouraging the effects of the counseling session for the counselee. A summary of the analysis is seen in Table 3.

An analysis of the three variables of counselor attractiveness, skills and ethical practices has shown a significant relationship with the effects of the counseling session on the counselee. This indicates that if these three variables are emphasized on, it will have a positive effect on the outcomes of the counseling session with the counselee, as shown in Table 4.

Effects of Counselor's Experience on Counselees in Counseling Sessions

One-way ANOVA was performed to determine if the counselor's experience made any difference to the effects of the counseling session. The results show that there are no significant differences in the effect of counseling sessions based on counselor experience (F (2, 10) = 0.381, p > .05). This proves that the length of service and counseling experience does not influence the effects of counseling on the counselee. A summary of this analysis can be seen in Table 4, while the differences in mean and standard deviation values, according to counselor's length of service, are presented in Table 6.

Table 2. Effects of Counseling on the Counselee according to Level of Agreement

Statement	Level of Agreement		
	Low (N / %)	Medium (N / %)	High (N / %)
Help to think better	2 (1.0)	20 (10.1)	176 (88.9)
Help to behave better	2 (1.0)	22 (11.1)	174 (87.9)
Understand own feelings more	2 (1.0)	28 (14.1)	168 (84.8)
Understand others more	3 (1.5)	27 (13.6)	168 (84.8)
Understand situation and environment more	2 (1.0)	24 (12.1)	172 (86.9)
Recommend counseling to others	4 (2.0)	19 (9.6)	175 (88.3)

The mean and standard deviation for each item on the effects of counseling on the counselee is presented in Table 2. Most of the indicators of the counselors' effectiveness are rated highly (mean > 6).

Table 3. Mean and Standard Deviation for Items on the Effects of Counseling

Statement	Mean	S.D.
Help to think better	6.08	0.736
Help to behave better	6.04	0.711
Understand own feelings more	6.03	0.760
Understand others more	5.02	0.787
Understand situation and environment more	6.01	0.705
Recommend counseling to others	6.01	0.764
Overall Mean	6.03	

Table 4. Relationship between Counselors' Attractiveness, Skills and Ethical Practices and the Effectiveness of Counseling Sessions

	Attractiveness	Skills	Ethics	Effect on Counselee
Attractiveness	-	.874**	.904**	.810**
Skills		-	.838**	.876**
Ethics			-	.792**

*p < .05

Table 5. One-Way ANOVA on the Effects of Counselors' Experience on the Counseling Sessions

Source of Variance	Df	SS	MS	F
Between Group	2	5.85	2.92	
Within Group	10	76.9	7.69	0.381
Total	12	82.7		

Table 6. Mean and Standard Deviation Values and Counselors' Experience

Length of Service	N	Mean	SD
1 to 3 years	5	37.6	3.28
4 to 10 years	7	38.5	2.37
10 years and above	1	40.0	-

Discussion

The discussion will highlight two main findings. First, the results show all three counselors' effectiveness in terms of their attractiveness, skills, and ethical practices have a positive relationship with the counseling outcomes as perceived by the counselee, which supports previous studies (Jang, 2010; Kwon & Jo, 2012; (Lin, 2001; Nerison & Claiborn, 1990; Seo, 2011; Stein, 1981). Second, the counselor's experience has no relationship with the counseling outcomes, which does not support past research (Kivlighan, 2008; Kwon & Jo, 2012) (Kivlighan, 2008; Kwon & Jo, 2012) other than Fatchurrahman (Fatchurrahman, 2016).

The significant relationship between the attractiveness of counselors and managing counseling sessions implies that counselors provide counseling services while showing good quality and personal appearance, perhaps in terms of emotional intelligence, makes counselees interested in getting counseling. The results of the study support findings from previous researchers such as Nurlatifah, Erlina et al., and Fatchurrahman (Nurlatifah, 2018; Erlina et al., 2017; Fatchurrahman, 2016), who also found that counselors who master all aspects of emotional intelligence have a positive effect in counseling sessions. The findings from Wahyuni (Wahyuni & Prakoso, 2015) study of self-efficacy and Yuliani (Yuliani, 2018) on holistic well-being are also consistent with the findings of this study, where this second element has a positive influence on counseling training sessions. Jang (2009) found empathy and personal wellness, consisting of essential self, coping self, and creative self, were related to counselees' perceived session smoothness and working alliance.

Results have also indicated the more-skilled counselors in terms of preparedness, skillfulness, and expertness as measured by expertness items of the CRF-S were rated positively by the respondents, and the counselees' perception of the counselor's characteristics related significantly to the counselees' behavioral change. This finding, which parallels international literature (Kwon & Jo, 2012; Nerison & Claiborn, 1990; Seo, 2011), adds to what is already known about having a positive relationship with expertness. Previous studies have discovered a relationship between expertness with session impact and session smoothness, while the present study adds the counselees' behavioral change to the list.

Studies by Sarwono (2018) perhaps indicate the counselors in the present study have demonstrated they have mastered the theories and have the capacity to apply them well in their counseling sessions. Similarly, Mahadita & Kurniawan (2017) and Kamaluddin (2011) also demonstrate that skills in counseling need to be applied in order to guarantee counseling session effectiveness. Mastery of theory and its application in counseling sessions, as well as other special skills, such as expertise and communication skills both verbal and non-verbal

(Nerison & Claiborn, 1990; Stein, 1981), were found to be positively correlated with counseling results.

This research also improves the ethical practice of counselors, the more effective counseling sessions. The findings of Ivey et al. (2010) and Nerison and Claiborn (1990) are consistent with the results of this study, where the counselee's trust and understanding of the counseling process increases if the counselor cares about ethical practices in accordance with professional standards. More focused ethical codes can hinder misappropriation or manipulation that may damage the counselee's trust for the counselor. Therefore, a responsible counselor will always pay attention to this matter and adhere to the appointed standards to ensure collective well-being.

Although the present findings are not new (Jang, 2010; Lin, 2001; Nerison & Claiborn, 1990; Seo, 2011; Stein, 1981; Kwon & Jo, 2012), studies on Indonesia counselors have so far only focused on the counselors' perception of their work (Erlina et al., 2017; Sarwono, 2018; Yuliani, 2018; Nurlatifah, 2018). Erlina et al and Yuliani reported that their participants (counselors) believed the counselors' knowledge on theories, choice of approaches, and skills demonstrated in counseling sessions impact the counseling outcomes. As data is collected from counselees, the present study offers a new dimension to the knowledge body of counseling practices in Indonesia. As indicated in the findings, counselees acknowledged their counseling sessions have helped them to grow in their thinking and behaviors and have created a better understanding of themselves and others, as well as their environments. All of them rate the counselors they have seen as attractive, skillful, and ethical, and they attributed these counselor characteristics to their own growth or change.

Research has shown that the choice of approach, focus, and communication style of counselor can produce various levels of counselor effectiveness, in some cases mediated by counselee characteristics (Choi et al, 2010; Lin, 2001; Seo, 2011; Stein, 1981). When we do not discuss counselor or counselee characteristics, a positive result in his debate with the complexity of the counselor in this study requires further verification.

The second main finding to be highlighted is that the experience of the counselor was found to have no effect on the outcome of the counseling. This is based on research findings that do not show a significant relationship between counseling experience and the results of counseling sessions. Fatchurahman (2017) study, which found gender and counseling experience factors did not influence a counselor's competence, is also in line with this study. Participants in this study, as in the study of Fatchurahman (2017), did not find that the level of experience of the counselor affected the perceived outcome of the counseling, although there was evidence to suggest that more experienced counselors deal with important issues using their deep insights, leading on more positive counseling results (Kivlighan, 2008; Kwon & Jo, 2012). Because participants in this study assess the effectiveness of counselors based on reflections of their past counseling experiences, in the survey study method, this might influence participants' perceptions about counselor effectiveness, which are felt in a more general perspective. The Fatchurahman study, which has similar results, also uses survey methods, while most studies (Jang, 2010; Kwon & Jo, 2012; Lin, 2001; Seo, 2011; Stein, 1981) which examine the level of counselor experience are carried out using the method field study. Those studies indicated that counselor experience level does have an impact on counseling outcomes. Given these conflicting conclusions, more studies to determine the relationship between counsellor experience level and counselling effectiveness are required.

Conclusion

The results of the study show the factors of attractiveness, skills, and ethical practices of the counselor have a positive relationship with the counseling outcomes as perceived by the counselee, while counselor's experience in counseling is not correlated with the counseling outcomes. The findings imply factors of the counselor's attractiveness, counseling skills, and ethical practices are aspects that need to be considered in the context of counseling benefits to counselees. The counselor's ability to balance the external physical aspects with consistently enhancing skills and knowledge of ethical issues in counseling will increase the effectiveness of the counseling services provided.

However, we also note some limitations of the present study. The study employed a quantitative method using a survey questionnaire involving a small sample size; hence, the results obtained are insufficient to provide a comprehensive representation of the aspects under study. Future researchers in the field would thus do well to consider using an appropriate sample size and sample type of both counselors and counselees, employing a field study design, and including the variables indicated in the previous discussion in order to gain further insight into this issue. Nevertheless, it is hoped that this study is a starting point from which to identify the indicators determining counseling services effectiveness. Through these indicators, counseling services will improve when counseling training includes aspects of a counselor's attractiveness in its curriculum adding to the existing focus on skills and ethics.

Still, the study offers two major implications. Theoretically, the present findings imply support for Strong's proposition (1968) that a counselor's characteristics of attractiveness, expertness, and trustworthiness influence counseling outcomes. Second, what Indonesia counselees perceived as important in counseling sessions are similar to most of the findings in international literature, implying the counselor's effective characteristics are global characteristics that have implications for cross-cultural counseling.

Reference

1. Brammer, L. M. (1973). *The helping relationship: Process and skills.* Prentice-Hall.

2. Choi, K. H., Buskey, W., & Johnson, B. (2010). Evaluation of counseling outcomes at a university counseling center: The impact of clinically significant change on problem resolution and academic functioning. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, *57*(3), 297–303. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0020029

3. Corey, G. (2015). *Theory and practice of counseling and psychotherapy.* Nelson Education.

4. Cornelius-White, H. D. J., & Carver, L. . (2012). Effect of an Encounter Grup for Counselor-In Training on Development of Person-Centered Core Condition. *Hellenic Journal of Psychology*, *9*, 205–221.

5. Corrigan, J. D., & Schmidt, L. D. (1983). Development and validation of revisions in the Counselor. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, *30*(1), 64–75. https://doi.org/10.1037/00220167.30.1.64

6. Ellingham, I. (1999). Carls Rogers "Cogruence As An Organismic Not A Freudian Concept. *The Person-Centered Journal*, *6*(2), 121–140.

7. Erlina, N., Syafril, S., Noor, N. M., Umar, J., & Wekke, I. S. (2017). *Keterampilan Dasar Menjalankan Sesi Konseling Oleh Calon Guru-Guru Konseling*. *00*. https://doi.org/10.31227/osf.io/6m9wp

8. Fatchurrahman, M. (2016). Problematik Pelaksanaan Konseling Individual. *Jurnal Bimbingan Dan Konseling Ar-Rahman*, *2*(01), 1–8. https://www.academia.edu/36192734/upaya_konselor_untuk_meningkatkan_motivasi_berprestasi_korban_bullying_dilihat_dari_perspektif_pendekatan_konseling_solution-focused_brief_theraphy

9. Feller, C. P., & Cottone, R. R. (2003). The importance of empathy in the therapeutic alliance. *The Journal of Humanistic Counseling*, *42*(1), 53–61. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2164-490X.2003.tb00168.x

10. Gatongi, F. (2007). Person-centred approach in schools: Is it the answer to disruptive behaviour in our classrooms? *Counselling Psychology Quarterly*, *20*(2), 205–211.

11. Gilliland, B. E., & et al. (1983). *Theories and strategies in counseling and psychotherapy*. Prentice-Hall.

12. Hall, C. S., & Lindzey, G. (1970). *Theories of Personality. New York: John Willey & Sons*. Inc.

13. Ivey, A. E., Ivey, M. B., & Zalaquett, C. P. (2010). *Intentional interviewing & counseling facilitating client development in a multicultural society (7th ed.)*. Pacific Grove, CA: Brooks/Cole.

14. Jang, Y. J. (2010). The influence of Korean counselors' personal wellness on client-perceived counseling effectiveness: The moderating effects of empathy. *Dissertation Abstracts International: Section B: The Sciences and Engineering*, *71*(2-B), 1368. http://search.ebscohost.com/login. aspx?direct=true&db=psyh&AN=2010-99160-505&site=ehost-live

15. Kendall, P. C., & Norton-Ford, J. D. (1982). *Clinical Psychology: Scientific and professional dimensions*. Wiley Online Library.

16. Kivlighan, M. D. (2008). Structural changes in counselor trainee intention use and clients' session evaluation. *Journal of Psychotherapy Research*, *18*(5), 560–572. https://doi.org/10.1080/10503300802 010830

17. Kwon, K. I., & Jo, S. Y. (2012). The relationship among counselor experience level, empathic accuracy, and counseling outcome in the early phase of counselling. *Educational Research*, *13*(4), 771–777.

18. Lambert, M. J., & Barley, D. E. (2001). Research summary on the therapeutic relationship and psychotherapy outcome. *Psychotherapy: Theory, Research, Practice, Training*, *38*(4), 357.

19. Lin, Y. (2001). The effects of counseling styles and stages on perceived counselor effectiveness from Taiwanese female university clients. *Asian Journal of Counselling*, *8*(1), 35–59.

20. Lynch, M. M. (2012). *Factors influencing successful psychotherapy outcomes*.

21. Mahadita, Fitriana., Kurniawan, K. (2017). Analysis of the application of basic counseling skills. *Indonesia Journal of Guidance and Counseling: Theory and Application*, *6*(2), 8–14.

22. Moon, K. A. (2007). A Client□Centered Review of Rogers With Gloria. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, *85*(3), 277–285.

23. Nerison, R. M., & Claiborn, C. D. (1990). *Counselor attractiveness, similarity, and session impact: A Field Study*.

24. Nurlatifah, A. (2018). *Urgensi Kecerdasan Emosional bagi Konselor Sekolah: Telaah atas Tulisan Ackerman dan Shelton dalam Practitioner's Perspective on School Counseling and Emotional Intelligence*.

25. Ponterotto, J. G., & Furlong, M. J. (1985). Evaluating counselor effectiveness: A critical review of rating scale instruments. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, *32*(4), 597–616. https://doi.org/10.1037/0022-0167.32.4.597

26. Salleh, A., Rorlinda, Y., & Noriah, I. (2010). Self-efficay and counseling competency. *International Journal of Knowledge, Culture and Change Management*, *10*(6), 61–70.

27. Sarwono, B. . (2018). *Inspiring the indigenous spirit in praxis in counseling in Indonesia*.

28. Seo, Y. S. (2011). Individualism, collectivism, and client expression of different emotions: Their relations to perceived counselor effectiveness. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, *12*(2), 251–262.

29. Sheu, H. B., Rigali-Oiler, M., & Lent, R. W. (2012). Multicultural counseling self-efficacy scale-racial diversity form: Factor structure and test of a social cognitive model. *Journal of Psychotherapy Research*, *22*(5), 527–542. https://doi.org/10.1080/10503307.2012.683344

30. Stein, S. J. (1981). *Client's perception of counselor trustworthiness expertness and attractiveness as a function of counselor race and dialect*. florida.

31. Strong, S. R. (1968). An interpersonal influence process. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, *15*, 215–224. https://doi.org/10.1037/h0020229

32. Wahyuni, N. Esa., & Prakoso, T. E. (2015). Self-efficacy Konselor Sekolah dalam Mengembangkan Pendidikan Karakter Siswa. *Jurnal Inspirasi Pendidikan*, *5*(1), 644–654. https://doi.org/10.21067/jip.v5i1.698

33. Wilkins, P., & Bozarth, J. D. (2001). Unconditional positive regard in context. In *Rogers' Therapeutic Conditions: Evolution, Theory and Practice* (Vol. 3).

34. Yuliani, I. (2018). Counseling Konsep Psychological Well-Being. *Journal of Innovative Counseling : Theory, Practice & Research*, *2*(2), 51–56.